

# xtseqreg: Sequential (two-stage) estimation of linear panel data models and some pitfalls in the estimation of dynamic panel models

Sebastian Kripfganz

University of Exeter Business School, Department of Economics, Exeter, UK

23<sup>rd</sup> UK Stata Users Group Meeting

London, September 7, 2017



```
net install xtseqreg, from(http://www.kripfganz.de/stata/) OR ssc install xtseqreg
```

# Time-invariant regressors in linear panel models

- In many applications, important determinants of the outcome variable can be time invariant.
  - Education, gender, nationality, ethnic and religious background, and other individual-specific characteristics play important roles in the determination of labor market or health outcomes.
  - Institutional, socio-economic, and geographic factors matter in convergence models of economic growth, and they are key variables in gravity models of international trade and investment flows.
- A researcher might be particularly interested in their effects. Yet, traditional “fixed-effects” procedures (`xtreg, fe`) wipe out all time-invariant variables from the model.

# Time-invariant regressors in linear panel models

- To identify the coefficients of time-invariant regressors, the assumption that a sufficient number of regressors (or excluded instrumental variables) is uncorrelated with the unit-specific error component cannot be avoided.
- Identification strategies for static panel models include:
  - Classical “random-effects” model: `xtreg`, `re`,
  - “Correlated random-effects” (Mundlak, 1978; Chamberlain, 1982) or “hybrid” models (Allison, 2009; Schunck, 2013): `xthybrid` (Schunck and Perales, 2017),
  - Hausman and Taylor (1981) model: `xthtaylor`,
  - Other instrumental variables strategies: `xtivreg`.

# Time-invariant regressors in linear panel models

- In the context of dynamic panel models, generalized method of moments (GMM) estimators (Arellano and Bover, 1995; Blundell and Bond, 1998) are frequently employed: `xtdpd`, `xtdpdsys`, and `xtabond2` (Roodman, 2009).
- Incorrect assumptions about the exogeneity of some variables may cause inconsistency of all coefficient estimates.
- A sequential procedure can provide partial robustness to such misspecification. In a first stage, only the coefficients of time-varying regressors are estimated. In a second stage, the coefficients of time-invariant regressors are recovered.

⇒ New Stata command: `xtseqreg`

# Two-stage estimation

- Linear panel data model with time-invariant regressors and error-components structure:

$$y_{it} = \mathbf{x}'_{it}\beta + \mathbf{f}'_i\gamma + u_i + e_{it}$$

- Sequential estimation procedure:
  - ① Estimation of the coefficients of time-varying regressors:

$$y_{it} = \mathbf{x}'_{it}\beta + \tilde{u}_i + e_{it}, \quad \tilde{u}_i = \mathbf{f}'_i\gamma + u_i$$

- ② Estimation of the coefficients of time-invariant regressors:

$$y_{it} - \mathbf{x}'_{it}\hat{\beta} = \mathbf{f}'_i\gamma + u_i + \tilde{e}_{it}, \quad \tilde{e}_{it} = e_{it} - \mathbf{x}'_{it}(\hat{\beta} - \beta)$$

- Conventional standard errors at the second stage are incorrect and often far too small.
- ⇒ xtseqreg computes proper standard errors with the analytical correction term derived by Kripfganz and Schwarz (2015).

# Stata syntax of the xtseqreg command

## Syntax

```
xtseqreg depvar [(indepvars1)] [(indepvars2)] [if] [in] [, options]
```

| <i>options</i>                      | Description  |
|-------------------------------------|--|
| <b>Model</b>                        |  |
| <u>first</u> ( <i>first_spec</i> )  | specify first-stage estimation results                                   |
| <u>both</u>                         | estimate both stages   |
| <u>nocommonsample</u>               | do not restrict estimation samples to be the same                        |
| <u>iv</u> ( <i>iv_spec</i> )        | standard instruments; can be specified more than once                    |
| <u>gmmiv</u> ( <i>gmmiv_spec</i> )  | GMM-type instruments; can be specified more than once                    |
| <u>wmatrix</u> ( <i>wmat_spec</i> ) | specify initial weighting matrix   |
| <u>twostep</u>                      | compute two-step instead of one-step estimator                           |
| <u>teffects</u>                     | add time effects to the model  |
| <u>noconstant</u>                   | suppress constant term   |
| <b>SE/Robust</b>                    |  |
| <u>vce</u> ( <i>vcetype</i> )       | <i>vcetype</i> may be <b>conventional</b> , <b>ec</b> , or <b>robust</b> |
| <b>Reporting</b>                    |  |
| <u>combine</u>                      | combine the estimation results for both equations                        |
| <u>level</u> (#)                    | set confidence level; default is <b>level(95)</b>                        |
| <u>noheader</u>                     | suppress output header   |
| <u>notable</u>                      | suppress coefficient table   |
| <u>noomitted</u>                    | suppress omitted variables   |

# Stata syntax of xtseqreg postestimation commands

## Syntax for predict

```
predict [type] newvar [if] [in] [, xb stdp ue xbu u e equation(eqno)]
```

```
predict [type] {stub*|newvar1 ... newvarq} [if] [in] , scores
```

## Syntax for estat

Arellano-Bond test for autocorrelated residuals

```
estat serial [, ar(numlist)]
```

Hansen's J-test of overidentifying restrictions

```
estat overid
```

Difference-in-Hansen test of overidentifying restrictions

```
estat overid name
```

Generalized Hausman test for model misspecification

```
estat hausman name [(varlist)] [, df(#) nonested]
```

where *name* is a name under which estimation results were stored via `estimates store`.

# Empirical example: distance and FDI

- Estimation of a gravity model for U.S. outward FDI.
- Annual data, 1989–1999, for 341 bilateral industry-level relationships, compiled by Egger and Pfaffermayr (2004).

```
. describe
```

Contains data from C:\data\_us.dta

|       |         |                                   |
|-------|---------|-----------------------------------|
| obs:  | 2,767   | Egger and Pfaffermayr (2004, JAE) |
| vars: | 13      | 8 Aug 2003 03:39                  |
| size: | 118,981 |                                   |

---

| variable name | storage type | display format | value label | variable label                             |
|---------------|--------------|----------------|-------------|--|
| ind           | byte         | %9.0g          |             | industry identifier                        |
| codeim        | int          | %8.0g          |             | country identifier                         |
| year          | int          | %9.0g          |             | year                                       |
| lrfdi         | float        | %9.0g          |             | log real outward foreign direct investment |
| lgdt          | float        | %9.0g          |             | log bilateral gross domestic product       |
| lsimi         | float        | %9.0g          |             | log similarity in country size             |
| lrk           | float        | %9.0g          |             | log relative physical capital endowment    |
| lrh           | float        | %9.0g          |             | log relative human capital endowment       |
| lrl           | float        | %9.0g          |             | log relative labor endowment               |
| ldist         | float        | %9.0g          |             | log geographical distance                  |
| lkgdt         | float        | %9.0g          |             | = lgdt * abs(lrk)                          |
| lkldist       | float        | %9.0g          |             | = ldist * (lrk - lrl)                      |
| id            | int          | %9.0g          |             | group(codeim ind)                          |

---

Sorted by: **id year**



# First-stage system GMM estimation

```
. xtseqreg L(0/1).lrfdi lkldist lgdt lkgdt lsimi lrk lrh lrl, twostep vce(robust) ///
> gmmiv(L.lrfdi, lag(1 5) collapse model(difference)) ///
> gmmiv(lkldist lgdt lkgdt lsimi lrk lrh lrl, lag(0 4) collapse model(difference)) ///
> iv(L.lrfdi, difference model(level)) ///
> iv(lkldist lgdt lkgdt lsimi lrk lrh lrl, difference model(level))
```

```
Group variable: id                Number of obs      =       2198
Time variable: year              Number of groups   =        337

                                Obs per group:   min =         1
                                                avg =       6.522255
                                                max =         10

                                Number of instruments =        49
```

(Std. Err. adjusted for clustering on id)

| lrfdi   | WC-Robust |           | z     | P> z  | [95% Conf. Interval] |          |
|---------|-----------|-----------|-------|-------|----------------------|----------|
|         | Coef.     | Std. Err. |       |       |                      |          |
| lrfdi   |           |           |       |       |                      |          |
| L1.     | .8956164  | .063313   | 14.15 | 0.000 | .7715252             | 1.019708 |
| lkldist | -.0978499 | .1490779  | -0.66 | 0.512 | -.3900371            | .1943374 |
| lgdt    | -.1502013 | .2320426  | -0.65 | 0.517 | -.6049964            | .3045939 |
| lkgdt   | .0072154  | .0053281  | 1.35  | 0.176 | -.0032276            | .0176584 |
| lsimi   | .3100215  | .2370884  | 1.31  | 0.191 | -.1546632            | .7747062 |
| lrk     | .7471581  | 1.291878  | 0.58  | 0.563 | -1.784877            | 3.279193 |
| lrh     | -.0897363 | .1311771  | -0.68 | 0.494 | -.3468386            | .1673661 |
| lrl     | -.8973519 | 1.30242   | -0.69 | 0.491 | -3.450048            | 1.655344 |
| _cons   | 4.926161  | 5.971464  | 0.82  | 0.409 | -6.777694            | 16.63002 |

```
. estimates store gmm1
```

# First-stage system GMM estimation

```
. estat serial, ar(1/3)

Arellano-Bond test for autocorrelation of the first-differenced residuals
H0: no autocorrelation of order 1:      z =  -7.3012   Prob > |z| =  0.0000
H0: no autocorrelation of order 2:      z =  -0.0535   Prob > |z| =  0.9573
H0: no autocorrelation of order 3:      z =  -0.3725   Prob > |z| =  0.7095

. estat overid

Hansen's J-test                               chi2(40)    =  45.7042
H0: overidentifying restrictions are valid     Prob > chi2 =  0.2471
```

- Replication with `xtabond2`:

```
. xtabond2 L(0/1).lrfdi lkldist lgdt lkgdt lsimi lrk lrh lrl, twostep robust ar(3) ///
> gmm(lrfdi, lag(2 6) collapse equation(diff)) ///
> gmm(lkldist lgdt lkgdt lsimi lrk lrh lrl, lag(0 4) collapse equation(diff)) ///
> iv(LD.lrfdi, equation(level) mz) ///
> iv(D.lkldist D.lgdt D.lkgdt D.lsimi D.lrk D.lrh D.lrl, equation(level) mz)

-----
Arellano-Bond test for AR(1) in first differences: z =  -6.69   Pr > z =  0.000
Arellano-Bond test for AR(2) in first differences: z =  -0.05   Pr > z =  0.957
Arellano-Bond test for AR(3) in first differences: z =  -0.37   Pr > z =  0.709
-----
Sargan test of overid. restrictions: chi2(40)    =  80.12   Prob > chi2 =  0.000
(Not robust, but not weakened by many instruments.)
Hansen test of overid. restrictions: chi2(40)    =  45.70   Prob > chi2 =  0.247
(Robust, but weakened by many instruments.)
```

# How (not) to do xtabond2: Always double check!

- The first two specifications yield identical estimation results. The results from the last specification differ (but should not):

```
. xtseqreg L(0/1).lrfdi lkldist lgdt lkgdt lsimi lrk lrh lrl, twostep vce(robust) ///
> gmmiv(L.lrfdi, lag(1 5) collapse model(difference)) ///
> gmmiv(lkldist lgdt lkgdt lsimi lrk lrh lrl, lag(0 4) collapse model(difference)) ///
> iv(L.lrfdi, difference model(level)) ///
> iv(lkldist lgdt lkgdt lsimi lrk lrh lrl, difference model(level))

. xtabond2 L(0/1).lrfdi lkldist lgdt lkgdt lsimi lrk lrh lrl, twostep robust ar(3) ///
> gmm(lrfdi, lag(2 6) collapse equation(diff)) ///
> gmm(lkldist lgdt lkgdt lsimi lrk lrh lrl, lag(0 4) collapse equation(diff)) ///
> iv(LD.lrfdi, equation(level) mz) ///
> iv(D.lkldist D.lgdt D.lkgdt D.lsimi D.lrk D.lrh D.lrl, equation(level) mz)

. xtabond2 L(0/1).lrfdi lkldist lgdt lkgdt lsimi lrk lrh lrl, twostep robust ar(3) ///
> gmm(L.lrfdi, lag(1 5) collapse equation(diff)) ///
> gmm(lkldist lgdt lkgdt lsimi lrk lrh lrl, lag(0 4) collapse equation(diff)) ///
> iv(LD.lrfdi, equation(level) mz) ///
> iv(D.lkldist D.lgdt D.lkgdt D.lsimi D.lrk D.lrh D.lrl, equation(level) mz)
```

# Second-stage 2SLS estimation

```
. xtseqreg lrfdi (L.lrfdi lkldist lgdt lkgdt lsimi lrk lrh lrl) ldist, vce(robust) ///
> first(gmm1, nocons) iv(lsimi lrh)
```

```
Group variable: id                Number of obs      =       2198
Time variable: year              Number of groups   =        337
```

```
Equation _first                  Equation _second
Number of obs                    =       2198      Number of obs      =       2198
Number of groups                 =        337      Number of groups   =        337
```

```
Obs per group:   min =         1      Obs per group:   min =         1
                  avg =   6.522255    avg =   6.522255
                  max =         10    max =         10
```

```
Number of instruments =         49      Number of instruments =         3
```

(Std. Err. adjusted for clustering on id)

|                |           | Robust    |       |       | [95% Conf. Interval] |          |
|----------------|-----------|-----------|-------|-------|----------------------|----------|
|                | Coef.     | Std. Err. | z     | P> z  |                      |          |
| <b>_first</b>  |           |           |       |       |                      |          |
| lrfdi          |           |           |       |       |                      |          |
| L1.            | .8956164  | .063313   | 14.15 | 0.000 | .7715252             | 1.019708 |
| lkldist        | -.0978499 | .1490779  | -0.66 | 0.512 | -.3900371            | .1943374 |
| lgdt           | -.1502013 | .2320426  | -0.65 | 0.517 | -.6049964            | .3045939 |
| lkgdt          | .0072154  | .0053281  | 1.35  | 0.176 | -.0032276            | .0176584 |
| lsimi          | .3100215  | .2370884  | 1.31  | 0.191 | -.1546632            | .7747062 |
| lrk            | .7471581  | 1.291878  | 0.58  | 0.563 | -1.784877            | 3.279193 |
| lrh            | -.0897363 | .1311771  | -0.68 | 0.494 | -.3468386            | .1673661 |
| lrl            | -.8973519 | 1.30242   | -0.69 | 0.491 | -3.450048            | 1.655344 |
| <b>_second</b> |           |           |       |       |                      |          |
| ldist          | -.1213967 | .5854263  | -0.21 | 0.836 | -1.268811            | 1.026018 |
| _cons          | 5.966496  | 8.5777    | 0.70  | 0.487 | -10.84549            | 22.77848 |

# Second-stage 2SLS estimation

```
. estat overid
```

```
Hansen's J-test for equation _first                chi2(40)   =   45.7042
H0: overidentifying restrictions are valid           Prob > chi2 =   0.2471
```

```
Hansen's J-test for equation _second             chi2(1)    =   1.1989
H0: overidentifying restrictions are valid           Prob > chi2 =   0.2735
```

- Replication with `ivregress` (incorrect standard errors):

```
. quietly estimates restore gmm1
```

```
. quietly predict residuals, ue
```

```
. ivregress 2sls residuals (ldist = lsimi lrh), vce(cluster id)
```

```
Instrumental variables (2SLS) regression           Number of obs   =   2,198
                                                    Wald chi2(1)    =   2.15
                                                    Prob > chi2     =   0.1422
                                                    R-squared       =   0.0107
                                                    Root MSE       =   .46723
```

(Std. Err. adjusted for 337 clusters in id)

| residuals | Coef.     | Robust<br>Std. Err. | z     | P> z  | [95% Conf. Interval] |          |
|-----------|-----------|---------------------|-------|-------|----------------------|----------|
| ldist     | -.1213967 | .0827107            | -1.47 | 0.142 | -.2835066            | .0407132 |
| _cons     | 1.040335  | .7110881            | 1.46  | 0.143 | -.3533725            | 2.434042 |

```
Instrumented:  ldist
```

```
Instruments:  lsimi lrh
```

# One-stage GMM estimation

```
. xtseqreg L(0/1).lrfdi lkldist lgdt lkgdt lsimi lrk lrh lrl ldist, twostep vce(robust) ///
> gmmiv(L.lrfdi, lag(1 5) collapse model(difference)) ///
> gmmiv(lkldist lgdt lkgdt lsimi lrk lrh lrl, lag(0 4) collapse model(difference)) ///
> iv(L.lrfdi, difference model(level)) ///
> iv(lkldist lgdt lkgdt lsimi lrk lrh lrl, difference model(level)) ///
> iv(lsimi lrh)
```

```
Group variable: id                Number of obs      =    2198
Time variable: year              Number of groups   =     337

                                Obs per group:   min =     1
                                                avg =   6.522255
                                                max =     10

                                Number of instruments =     51
```

(Std. Err. adjusted for clustering on id)

|         | Coef.     | WC-Robust<br>Std. Err. | z     | P> z  | [95% Conf. Interval] |          |
|---------|-----------|------------------------|-------|-------|----------------------|----------|
| lrfdi   |           |                        |       |       |                      |          |
| L1.     | .874835   | .0658537               | 13.28 | 0.000 | .7457641             | 1.003906 |
| lkldist |           |                        |       |       |                      |          |
| lgdt    | -.0894573 | .1552895               | -0.58 | 0.565 | -.3938191            | .2149044 |
| lkgdt   | -.100095  | .2389068               | -0.42 | 0.675 | -.5683437            | .3681537 |
| lsimi   | .0103749  | .0053781               | 1.93  | 0.054 | -.000166             | .0209159 |
| lrk     | .3735686  | .2467129               | 1.51  | 0.130 | -.1099798            | .8571171 |
| lrh     | .6246915  | 1.349609               | 0.46  | 0.643 | -2.020494            | 3.269877 |
| lrl     | -.0007819 | .1125051               | -0.01 | 0.994 | -.2212878            | .2197241 |
| ldist   | -.7648876 | 1.37943                | -0.55 | 0.579 | -3.468521            | 1.938746 |
| _cons   | -.0825973 | .1385583               | -0.60 | 0.551 | -.3541665            | .1889719 |
| _cons   | 4.320648  | 6.06585                | 0.71  | 0.476 | -7.5682              | 16.2095  |

```
. estat hausman gmm1 (L.lrfdi lkldist lgdt lkgdt lsimi lrk lrh lrl)
```

```
Generalized Hausman test                chi2(1)      =    4.4792
H0: coefficients do not systematically differ  Prob > chi2 =    0.0343
```

# How (not) to do xtabond2: Remember the assumptions!

```
. estat overid gmm1
```

```
Difference-in-Hansen test                chi2(1)    =    2.6932
H0: overidentifying restrictions are valid  Prob > chi2 =    0.1008
```

- Instruments for the first-differenced equation are uncorrelated with time-invariant variables by construction, first-differenced instruments for the level equation by assumption.
- ⇒ Difference-in-Hansen tests might be based on asymptotically incorrect (or at least debatable) degrees of freedom:

```
. xtabond2 L(0/1).lrfdi lkldist lgdt lkgdt lsimi lrk lrh lrl ldist, twostep robust ///
> gmm(lrfdi, lag(2 6) collapse equation(diff)) ///
> gmm(lkldist lgdt lkgdt lsimi lrk lrh lrl, lag(0 4) collapse equation(diff)) ///
> iv(LD.lrfdi, equation(level) mz) ///
> iv(D.lkldist D.lgdt D.lkgdt D.lsimi D.lrk D.lrh D.lrl, equation(level) mz) ///
> iv(lsimi lrh, equation(level) mz)
```

Difference-in-Hansen tests of exogeneity of instrument subsets:

```
iv(lsimi lrh, mz eq(level))
Hansen test excluding group:    chi2(39)    =    45.95    Prob > chi2 =    0.206
Difference (null H = exogenous): chi2(2)    =    2.44    Prob > chi2 =    0.295
```

# Alternative first-stage QML estimator

- First-stage QML estimator of Hsiao et al. (2002):

```
. quietly xtqpdqml lrfdi lkldist lgdt lkgdt lsimi lrk lrh lrl, fe mparam vce(robust)

. xtseqreg lrfdi (L.lrfdi lkldist lgdt lkgdt lsimi lrk lrh lrl) ldist, vce(robust) ///
> first(, nocons) iv(lsimi lrh) noheader
note: first-stage variable names do not match with coefficient list from xtqpdqml
note: dependent variable D.lrfdi from xtqpdqml does not match with lrfdi
```

(Std. Err. adjusted for clustering on id)

|                | Coef.     | Robust<br>Std. Err. | z     | P> z  | [95% Conf. Interval] |          |
|----------------|-----------|---------------------|-------|-------|----------------------|----------|
| <b>_first</b>  |           |                     |       |       |                      |          |
| lrfdi          |           |                     |       |       |                      |          |
| L1.            | .8000757  | .0539962            | 14.82 | 0.000 | .6942451             | .9059062 |
| lkldist        | -.7160072 | .5053811            | -1.42 | 0.157 | -1.706536            | .2745216 |
| lgdt           | .4346637  | .1907476            | 2.28  | 0.023 | .0608052             | .8085221 |
| lkgdt          | .0028906  | .0068807            | 0.42  | 0.674 | -.0105954            | .0163766 |
| lsimi          | .3172032  | .3605734            | 0.88  | 0.379 | -.3895076            | 1.023914 |
| lrk            | 6.152142  | 4.400668            | 1.40  | 0.162 | -2.473009            | 14.77729 |
| lrh            | .0758457  | .0869135            | 0.87  | 0.383 | -.0945017            | .2461931 |
| lrl            | -5.60704  | 4.175718            | -1.34 | 0.179 | -13.7913             | 2.577216 |
| <b>_second</b> |           |                     |       |       |                      |          |
| ldist          | 2.41061   | 2.285819            | 1.05  | 0.292 | -2.069514            | 6.890734 |
| _cons          | -31.43894 | 21.15977            | -1.49 | 0.137 | -72.91133            | 10.03345 |

```
. estat overid
```

```
Hansen's J-test for equation _second          chi2(1)    =    0.8358
H0: overidentifying restrictions are valid      Prob > chi2 =    0.3606
```



# Alternative first-stage GMM estimator

- First-stage GMM estimator of Ahn and Schmidt (1995):

```
. quietly xtddp gmm L(0/1).lrfdi lkldist lqdt lkgdt lsimi lrk lrh lrl, twostep noserial ///
> vce(robust) aux gmmiv(L.lrfdi, lag(1 5) collapse model(difference)) ///
> gmmiv(lkldist lqdt lkgdt lsimi lrk lrh lrl, lag(0 4) collapse model(difference))

. xtseqreg lrfdi (L.lrfdi lkldist lqdt lkgdt lsimi lrk lrh lrl) ldist, vce(robust) ///
> first(, copy) iv(lsimi lrh) noheader
note: first-stage standard errors may not be robust
```

(Std. Err. adjusted for clustering on id)

|                | lrfdi   | Robust<br>Coef. | Std. Err. | z     | P> z  | [95% Conf. Interval] |
|----------------|---------|-----------------|-----------|-------|-------|----------------------|
| <b>_first</b>  |         |                 |           |       |       |                      |
|                | lrfdi   |                 |           |       |       |                      |
|                | L1.     | .8017069        | .1204806  | 6.65  | 0.000 | .5655692 1.037845    |
|                | lkldist | -.2290635       | .7040092  | -0.33 | 0.745 | -1.608896 1.150769   |
|                | lqdt    | -.0748559       | .2905325  | -0.26 | 0.797 | -.6442891 .4945773   |
|                | lkgdt   | -.0186638       | .0112666  | -1.66 | 0.098 | -.0407459 .0034183   |
|                | lsimi   | .0212282        | .3722118  | 0.06  | 0.955 | -.7082936 .75075     |
|                | lrk     | 1.784527        | 6.101738  | 0.29  | 0.770 | -10.17466 13.74371   |
|                | lrh     | .0299533        | .1551918  | 0.19  | 0.847 | -.2742171 .3341238   |
|                | lrl     | -1.580551       | 6.123368  | -0.26 | 0.796 | -13.58213 10.42103   |
|                | _cons   | 3.642671        | 7.335562  | 0.50  | 0.619 | -10.73477 18.02011   |
| <b>_second</b> |         |                 |           |       |       |                      |
|                | ldist   | .3209373        | 1.580573  | 0.20  | 0.839 | -2.776928 3.418803   |
|                | _cons   | -2.761592       | 13.56865  | -0.20 | 0.839 | -29.35565 23.83247   |

```
. estat overid
```

```
Hansen's J-test for equation _second
H0: overidentifying restrictions are valid
```

```
chi2(1) = 2.7079
Prob > chi2 = 0.0999
```

# Time effects

```
. xtseqreg L(0/1).lrfdi, teffects twostep vce(robust) ///
> gmmiv(L.lrfdi, lag(1 5) collapse model(difference)) iv(L.lrfdi, difference model(level))
```

```
Group variable: id                Number of obs      =    2198
Time variable: year              Number of groups   =     337

Obs per group:   min =         1
                 avg =    6.522255
                 max =         10

Number of instruments =         16
```

(Std. Err. adjusted for clustering on id)

|  | lrfdi | Coef.     | WC-Robust<br>Std. Err. | z     | P> z  | [95% Conf. Interval] |           |
|--|-------|-----------|------------------------|-------|-------|----------------------|-----------|
|  | lrfdi |           |                        |       |       |                      |           |
|  | L1.   | 1.015676  | .0727146               | 13.97 | 0.000 | .8731579             | 1.158194  |
|  | year  |           |                        |       |       |                      |           |
|  | 1991  | -.0975429 | .0419594               | -2.32 | 0.020 | -.1797819            | -.0153039 |
|  | 1992  | -.0670002 | .0476785               | -1.41 | 0.160 | -.1604484            | .0264479  |
|  | 1993  | -.0945048 | .0457007               | -2.07 | 0.039 | -.1840766            | -.0049331 |
|  | 1994  | -.0644637 | .0701426               | -0.92 | 0.358 | -.2019406            | .0730132  |
|  | 1995  | -.0513381 | .0426408               | -1.20 | 0.229 | -.1349125            | .0322363  |
|  | 1996  | -.0605227 | .0481965               | -1.26 | 0.209 | -.1549861            | .0339408  |
|  | 1997  | -.1211606 | .0594696               | -2.04 | 0.042 | -.2377189            | -.0046024 |
|  | 1998  | -.1699316 | .0552347               | -3.08 | 0.002 | -.2781895            | -.0616736 |
|  | 1999  | -.1261552 | .0830178               | -1.52 | 0.129 | -.2888672            | .0365568  |
|  | _cons | .0937689  | .3189754               | 0.29  | 0.769 | -.5314114            | .7189492  |

```
. estat overid
```

```
Hansen's J-test                chi2(5)      =    13.2885
H0: overidentifying restrictions are valid  Prob > chi2 =    0.0208
```

# How (not) to do xtabond2: Beware of the dummy trap!

```
. xtabond2 L(0/1).lrfdi i.year, twostep robust ///
> gmm(lrfdi, lag(2 6) collapse equation(diff)) iv(LD.lrfdi, equation(level) mz) ///
> iv(i.year, equation(level))
```

| lrfdi | Coef.     | Corrected<br>Std. Err. | z     | P> z  | [95% Conf. Interval] |           |
|-------|-----------|------------------------|-------|-------|----------------------|-----------|
| lrfdi |           |                        |       |       |                      |           |
| L1.   | 1.015676  | .0727146               | 13.97 | 0.000 | .8731579             | 1.158194  |
| year  |           |                        |       |       |                      |           |
| 1989  | 0         | (empty)                |       |       |                      |           |
| 1990  | .0644637  | .0701426               | 0.92  | 0.358 | -.0730132            | .2019406  |
| 1991  | -.0330792 | .0597255               | -0.55 | 0.580 | -.150139             | .0839805  |
| 1992  | -.0025366 | .0513121               | -0.05 | 0.961 | -.1031064            | .0980333  |
| 1993  | -.0300412 | .0579887               | -0.52 | 0.604 | -.1436969            | .0836146  |
| 1994  | 0         | (omitted)              |       |       |                      |           |
| 1995  | .0131256  | .0551362               | 0.24  | 0.812 | -.0949394            | .1211905  |
| 1996  | .003941   | .055217                | 0.07  | 0.943 | -.1042823            | .1121643  |
| 1997  | -.056697  | .0504278               | -1.12 | 0.261 | -.1555337            | .0421398  |
| 1998  | -.1054679 | .04837                 | -2.18 | 0.029 | -.2002714            | -.0106643 |
| 1999  | -.0616915 | .0540627               | -1.14 | 0.254 | -.1676525            | .0442694  |
| _cons | .0293052  | .3703467               | 0.08  | 0.937 | -.696561             | .7551714  |

```
Hansen test of overid. restrictions: chi2(3) = 13.29 Prob > chi2 = 0.004
(Robust, but weakened by many instruments.)
```

# How (not) to do xtabond2: Always specify equation()!

- Instruments for the time dummies should only be included for the level equation. Asymptotically, the additional instruments for the first-differenced equation are redundant.

⇒ Hansen's J-test is based on incorrect degrees of freedom:

```
. xtabond2 L(0/1).lrfdi i.year, twostep robust ///
> gmm(lrfdi, lag(2 6) collapse equation(diff)) iv(LD.lrfdi, equation(level) mz) ///
> iv(i.year, equation(diff)) iv(i.year, equation(level))
```

```
Hansen test of overid. restrictions: chi2(12) = 14.82 Prob > chi2 = 0.252
(Robust, but weakened by many instruments.)
```

- Never use the iv() option without suboption equation()! It is not equivalent to the joint specification of iv(, equation(diff)) and iv(, equation(level)):

```
. xtabond2 L(0/1).lrfdi i.year, twostep robust ///
> gmm(lrfdi, lag(2 6) collapse equation(diff)) iv(LD.lrfdi, equation(level) mz) ///
> iv(i.year)
```

```
Hansen test of overid. restrictions: chi2(3) = 10.79 Prob > chi2 = 0.013
(Robust, but weakened by many instruments.)
```

# Summary: the new `xtseqreg` package for Stata

- Sequential estimation can provide partial robustness to model misspecification.
- It is important to compute corrected standard errors at the second stage that account for the first-stage estimation error.
- The new `xtseqreg` Stata command implements this standard error correction for two-stage linear panel data models.
- The two-stage procedure is particularly relevant in the presence of time-invariant regressors, but it can be easily applied to more general settings.

---

Kripfganz, S., and C. Schwarz (2015). Estimation of linear dynamic panel data models with time-invariant regressors. *ECB Working Paper 1838*. European Central Bank.

```
net install xtseqreg, from(http://www.kripfganz.de/stata/) OR ssc install xtseqreg
help xtseqreg
help xtseqreg postestimation
```

# References

- Ahn, S. C., and P. Schmidt (1995). Efficient estimation of models for dynamic panel data. *Journal of Econometrics* 68(1): 5–27.
- Allison, P. D. (2009). Fixed effects regression models. *Quantitative applications in the social sciences* 160. Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications.
- Arellano, M., and O. Bover (1995). Another look at the instrumental variable estimation of error-components models. *Journal of Econometrics* 68(1): 29–51.
- Blundell, R., and S. R. Bond (1991). Initial conditions and moment restrictions in dynamic panel data models. *Journal of Econometrics* 87(1): 115–143.
- Chamberlain, G. (1982). Multivariate regression models for panel data. *Journal of Econometrics* 18(1), 5–46.
- Egger, P., and M. Pfaffermayr (2004). Distance, trade and FDI: A Hausman-Taylor SUR approach. *Journal of Applied Econometrics* 19(2), 227–246; data set available from the JAE data archive: <http://qed.econ.queensu.ca/jae/2004-v19.2/egger-pfaffermayr/>.
- Hausman, J. A., and W. E. Taylor (1981). Panel data and unobservable individual effects. *Econometrica* 49(6), 1377–1398.
- Hsiao, C., M. H. Pesaran, and A. K. Tahmiscioglu (2002). Maximum likelihood estimation of fixed effects dynamic panel data models covering short time periods. *Journal of Econometrics* 109(1): 107–150.
- Kripfganz, S., and C. Schwarz (2015). Estimation of linear dynamic panel data models with time-invariant regressors. *ECB Working Paper 1838*. European Central Bank.
- Mundlak, Y. (1978). On the pooling of time series and cross section data. *Econometrica* 46(1), 69–85.
- Roodman, D. (2009). How to do xtabond2: An introduction to difference and system GMM in Stata. *Stata Journal* 9(1): 86–136.
- Schunck, D. (2013). Within and between estimates in random-effects models: Advantages and drawbacks of correlated random effects and hybrid models. *Stata Journal* 13(1): 65–76.
- Schunck, D., and F. Perales (2017). Within- and between-cluster effects in generalized linear mixed models: A discussion of approaches and the xthybrid command. *Stata Journal* 17(1): 89–115.