**xtregar** — Fixed- and random-effects linear models with an AR(1) disturbance

Description Options Acknowledgment Quick start Remarks and examples References Menu Stored results Also see Syntax Methods and formulas

# Description

Title

xtregar fits cross-sectional time-series regression models when the disturbance term is firstorder autoregressive. xtregar offers a within estimator for fixed-effects models and a GLS estimator for random-effects models. xtregar can accommodate unbalanced panels whose observations are unequally spaced over time.

# **Quick start**

Random-effects model of y on x1 with an AR(1) disturbance using xtset data xtregar y x1

Add x2 and x3 as covariates and perform Baltagi-Wu LBI test xtregar y x1 x2 x3, lbi

Fixed-effects model using the within estimator and observations where tvar is greater than 2,000 xtregar y x1 x2 x3 if tvar > 2000, fe

## Menu

Statistics > Longitudinal/panel data > Linear models > Linear regression with AR(1) disturbance (FE, RE)

## **Syntax**

GLS random-effects (RE	E) model
xtregar <i>depvar</i> [ <i>in</i>	depvars] [if] [in] [, re options]
Fixed-effects (FE) model	1
xtregar <i>depvar</i> [ <i>in</i>	depvars ] $[if]$ $[in]$ $[weight]$ , fe $[options]$
options	Description
Model	
re	use random-effects estimator; the default
fe	use fixed-effects estimator
<u>rhotype(rhomethod)</u>	specify method to compute autocorrelation; seldom u
rhof(#)	use # for $\rho$ and do not estimate $\rho$
<u>two</u> step	perform two-step estimate of correlation
Reporting	

Model	
re	use random-effects estimator; the default
fe	use fixed-effects estimator
<pre><u>rhotype(rhomethod)</u></pre>	specify method to compute autocorrelation; seldom used
rhof(#)	use # for $\rho$ and do not estimate $\rho$
<u>two</u> step	perform two-step estimate of correlation
Reporting	
<u>l</u> evel(#)	set confidence level; default is level(95)
lbi	perform Baltagi-Wu LBI test
display_options	control columns and column formats, row spacing, line width, display of omitted variables and base and empty cells, and factor-variable labeling
<u>coefl</u> egend	display legend instead of statistics
A panel variable and a time	variable must be specified; use xtset; see [XT] xtset.

indepvars may contain factor variables; see [U] 11.4.3 Factor variables.

depvar and indepvars may contain time-series operators; see [U] 11.4.4 Time-series varlists.

by, collect, and statsby are allowed; see [U] 11.1.10 Prefix commands.

fweights and aweights are allowed for the fixed-effects model with rhotype(regress) or rhotype(freg), or with a fixed rho; see [U] 11.1.6 weight. Weights must be constant within panel.

coeflegend does not appear in the dialog box.

See [U] 20 Estimation and postestimation commands for more capabilities of estimation commands.

# Options

Model

re requests the GLS estimator of the random-effects model, which is the default.

fe requests the within estimator of the fixed-effects model.

dw	$\rho_{\rm dw} = 1 - d/2$ , where d is the Durbin–Watson d statistic
regress	$ \rho_{\rm reg} = \beta $ from the residual regression $ \epsilon_t = \beta \epsilon_{t-1} $
freg	$ \rho_{\rm freg} = \beta $ from the residual regression $ \epsilon_t = \beta \epsilon_{t+1} $
<u>tsc</u> orr	$\rho_{\text{tscorr}} = \epsilon' \epsilon_{t-1} / \epsilon' \epsilon$ , where $\epsilon$ is the vector of residuals and $\epsilon_{t-1}$ is the vector of lagged residuals
<u>th</u> eil	$ \rho_{\rm theil} = \rho_{\rm tscorr}(N-k)/N $
nagar	$ ho_{ m nagar} = ( ho_{ m dw} N^2 + k^2) / (N^2 - k^2)$
<u>one</u> step	$ \rho_{\text{onestep}} = (n/m_c)(\epsilon'\epsilon_{t-1}/\epsilon'\epsilon) $ , where $\epsilon$ is the vector of residuals, $n$ is the number of observations, and $m_c$ is the number of consecutive pairs of residuals

rhotype(*rhomethod*) allows the user to specify any of the following estimators of  $\rho$ :

dw is the default method. Except for onestep, the details of these methods are given in [TS] **prais**. prais handles unequally spaced data. onestep is the one-step method proposed by Baltagi and Wu (1999). More details on this method are available below in *Methods and formulas*.

**rhof**(#) specifies that the given number be used for  $\rho$  and that  $\rho$  not be estimated.

twostep requests that a two-step implementation of the *rhomethod* estimator of  $\rho$  be used. Unless a fixed value of  $\rho$  is specified (with the rhof() option),  $\rho$  is estimated by running prais on the de-meaned data. When twostep is specified, prais will stop on the first iteration after the equation is transformed by  $\rho$ —the two-step efficient estimator. Although it is customary to iterate these estimators to convergence, they are efficient at each step. When twostep is not specified, the FGLS process iterates to convergence as described in the Methods and formulas of [TS] prais.

#### Reporting

level(#); see [R] Estimation options.

- 1bi requests that the Baltagi–Wu (1999) locally best invariant (LBI) test statistic that  $\rho = 0$  and a modified version of the Bhargava, Franzini, and Narendranathan (1982) Durbin–Watson statistic be calculated and reported. The default is not to report them. *p*-values are not reported for either statistic. Although Bhargava, Franzini, and Narendranathan (1982) published critical values for their statistic, no tables are currently available for the Baltagi–Wu LBI. Baltagi and Wu (1999) derive a normalized version of their statistic, but this statistic cannot be computed for datasets of moderate size. You can also specify these options upon replay.
- display\_options: noci, nopvalues, noomitted, vsquish, noemptycells, baselevels, allbaselevels, nofvlabel, fvwrap(#), fvwrapon(style), cformat(% fmt), pformat(% fmt), sformat(% fmt), and nolstretch; see [R] Estimation options.

The following option is available with xtregar but is not shown in the dialog box: coeflegend; see [R] Estimation options.

### **Remarks and examples**

#### stata.com

Remarks are presented under the following headings:

Introduction The fixed-effects model The random-effects model

### Introduction

If you have not read [XT] xt, please do so.

xtregar fits cross-sectional time-series regression models when the disturbance term is first-order autoregressive. The models of interest are described by

$$y_{it} = \alpha + \mathbf{x}_{it}\boldsymbol{\beta} + \nu_i + \epsilon_{it} \qquad i = 1, \dots, N; \quad t = 1, \dots, T_i \tag{1}$$

where

$$\epsilon_{it} = \rho \epsilon_{i,t-1} + \eta_{it} \tag{2}$$

and where  $|\rho| < 1$  and  $\eta_{it}$  is independent and identically distributed (i.i.d.) with mean 0 and variance  $\sigma_n^2$ .

In the fixed-effects model, the  $\nu_i$  are assumed to be correlated with the covariates  $\mathbf{x}_{it}$ , whereas in the random-effects model they are assumed to follow an i.i.d. process with mean 0 and variance  $\sigma_{\eta}^2$  and to be uncorrelated with the  $\mathbf{x}_{it}$ .

Similar to other linear panel-data models, any  $\mathbf{x}_{it}$  that do not vary over t are collinear with the  $\nu_i$  and will be omitted from the fixed-effects model. In contrast, the random-effects model can accommodate covariates that are constant over time.

**xtregar** offers a within estimator for the fixed-effect model and the Baltagi–Wu (1999) GLS estimator of the random-effects model. Both of these estimators offer several estimators of  $\rho$ .

The Baltagi–Wu (1999) GLS estimator extends the balanced panel estimator in Baltagi and Li (1991) to a case of exogenously unbalanced panels with unequally spaced observations. Specifically, the dataset contains observations on individual *i* at times  $t_{ij}$  for  $j = 1, ..., n_i$ . The difference  $t_{ij} - t_{i,j-1}$  plays an integral role in the estimation techniques used by xtregar.

For this reason, you must specify the delta() option when you xtset *panelvar timevar* if, for example, you have quarterly data with a monthly *timevar* recorded every three months instead of a quarterly *timevar*; see [XT] xtset.

### The fixed-effects model

Let's examine the fixed-effect model first. The basic approach is common to all fixed-effects models. The  $\nu_i$  are treated as nuisance parameters. We use a transformation of the model that removes the nuisance parameters and leaves behind the parameters of interest in an estimable form. Subtracting the group means from (1) removes the  $\nu_i$  from the model

$$y_{it_{ij}} - \overline{y}_i = \left(\overline{\mathbf{x}}_{it_{ij}} - \overline{\mathbf{x}}_i\right)\boldsymbol{\beta} + \epsilon_{it_{ij}} - \overline{\epsilon}_i \tag{3}$$

where

$$\overline{y}_i = \frac{1}{n_i} \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} y_{it_{ij}} \qquad \overline{\mathbf{x}}_i = \frac{1}{n_i} \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} \mathbf{x}_{it_{ij}} \qquad \overline{\epsilon}_i = \frac{1}{n_i} \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} \epsilon_{it_{ij}}$$

After the transformation, (3) is a linear AR(1) model, potentially with unequally spaced observations. (3) can be used to estimate  $\rho$ . Given an estimate of  $\rho$ , we must do a Cochrane–Orcutt transformation on each panel and then remove the within-panel means and add back the overall mean for each variable. OLS on the transformed data will produce the within estimates of  $\alpha$  and  $\beta$ .

#### Example 1: Fixed-effects model

Let's use the Grunfeld investment dataset to illustrate how xtregar can be used to fit the fixedeffects model. This dataset contains information on 10 firms' investment, market value, and the value of their capital stocks. The data were collected annually between 1935 and 1954. The following output shows that we have xtset our data and gives the results of running a fixed-effects model with investment as a function of market value and the capital stock.

```
. use https://www.stata-press.com/data/r18/grunfeld
. xtset
Panel variable: company (strongly balanced)
 Time variable: year, 1935 to 1954
         Delta: 1 year
. xtregar invest mvalue kstock, fe
FE (within) regression with AR(1) disturbances
                                                  Number of obs
                                                                              190
                                                                     =
Group variable: company
                                                  Number of groups
                                                                               10
R-squared:
                                                  Obs per group:
     Within = 0.5927
                                                                               19
                                                                min =
     Between = 0.7989
                                                                             19.0
                                                                avg =
     Overall = 0.7904
                                                                max =
                                                                               19
                                                  F(2,178)
                                                                     =
                                                                           129.49
corr(u_i, Xb) = -0.0454
                                                  Prob > F
                                                                           0.0000
      invest
               Coefficient
                             Std. err.
                                             t
                                                  P>|t|
                                                            [95% conf. interval]
                  .0949999
                             .0091377
                                         10.40
                                                  0.000
                                                            .0769677
                                                                          .113032
      mvalue
      kstock
                   .350161
                             .0293747
                                         11.92
                                                  0.000
                                                            .2921935
                                                                         .4081286
                -63.22022
                             5.648271
                                        -11.19
                                                  0.000
                                                           -74.36641
                                                                        -52.07402
       _cons
                 .67210608
      rho_ar
     sigma_u
                91.507609
     sigma_e
                40.992469
     rho_fov
                  .8328647
                             (fraction of variance because of u_i)
F test that all u_i=0: F(9,178) = 11.53
                                                               Prob > F = 0.0000
```

Because there are 10 groups, the panel-by-panel Cochrane–Orcutt method decreases the number of available observations from 200 to 190. The above example used the default dw estimator of  $\rho$ . Using the tscorr estimator of  $\rho$  yields

E (within) re	egression with	AR(1) dist	urbances	Number o	of obs =	190
Group variable	0				of groups =	10
R-squared:				Obs per	group:	
Within =	= 0.6583			-	min =	19
Between =	Between = $0.8024$				avg =	19.0
Overall =	= 0.7933				max =	19
				F(2,178)	) =	171.47
corr(u_i, Xb)	= -0.0709			Prob > 1		0.0000
invest	Coefficient	Std. err.	t	P> t	[95% conf.	interval]
	.0978364	.0096786	10.11	0.000	.0787369	.1169359
mvalue						
mvalue kstock	.346097	.0242248	14.29	0.000	.2982922	.3939018
	.346097 -61.84403		14.29 -9.34	0.000	.2982922 -74.91049	.3939018 -48.77758
kstock						
kstock _cons	-61.84403					
kstock _cons rho_ar	-61.84403 .54131231					

### Technical note

The tscorr estimator of  $\rho$  is bounded in [-1, 1]. The other estimators of  $\rho$  are not. In samples with short panels, the estimates of  $\rho$  produced by the other estimators of  $\rho$  may be outside [-1, 1]. If this happens, use the tscorr estimator. However, simulations have shown that the tscorr estimator is biased toward zero. dw is the default because it performs well in Monte Carlo simulations. In the example above, the estimate of  $\rho$  produced by tscorr is much smaller than the one produced by dw.

4

### Example 2: Using xtset

xtregar will complain if you try to run xtregar on a dataset that has not been xtset:

```
. xtset, clear
. xtregar invest mvalue kstock, fe
must specify panelvar and timevar; use xtset
r(459);
```

You must xtset your data to ensure that xtregar understands the nature of your time variable. Suppose that our observations were taken quarterly instead of annually. We will get the same results with the quarterly variable t2 that we did with the annual variable year.

generate t2	t = tq(1934q4)	+ t					
format t2 %							
	-						
list year t	2 1n 1/5						
year	t2						
1. 1935	1935q1						
2. 1936	1935q2						
3. 1937	1935q3						
4. 1938	1935q4						
5. 1939	1936q1						
	<b>`</b>						
xtset compa	uny t2						
anel variabl	.e: company (st	rongly bala	anced)				
Time variabl	e: t2, 1935q1	to 1939q4					
Delt	a: 1 quarter						
xtregar inv	est mvalue kst	cock, fe					
•	est mvalue kst		urbances	Number	fobe	_	190
E (within) r	egression with		turbances			=	190 10
FE (within) r Group variabl	egression with		turbances	Number o	f groups	=	
E (within) r Froup variabl R-squared:	egression with e: company		curbances		f groups group:		10
E (within) r Froup variabl S-squared: Within	regression with e: company = 0.5927		curbances	Number o	f groups group: mi	.n =	10 19
FE (within) r Group variabl R-squared: Within Between	egression with e: company		curbances	Number o	f groups group: mi av		10
FE (within) r Group variabl R-squared: Within Between	regression with e: company = 0.5927 = 0.7989		curbances	Number o	f groups group: mi av ma	n = g = x =	10 19 19.0 19
YE (within) r Group variabl G-squared: Within Between Overall	egression with e: company = 0.5927 = 0.7989 = 0.7904		turbances	Number o Obs per F(2,178)	f groups group: mi av ma	n = g = x = =	10 19 19.0 19 129.49
FE (within) r Group variabl R-squared: Within Between	egression with e: company = 0.5927 = 0.7989 = 0.7904		curbances	Number o	f groups group: mi av ma	n = g = x =	10 19 19.0 19
YE (within) r Group variabl G-squared: Within Between Overall	egression with e: company = 0.5927 = 0.7989 = 0.7904	n AR(1) dist	t t	Number o Obs per F(2,178)	f groups group: mi av ma	n = g = ux = = =	10 19 19.0 19 129.49
YE (within) r Froup variabl R-squared: Within Between Overall corr(u_i, Xb)	egression with e: company = 0.5927 = 0.7989 = 0.7904 = -0.0454 Coefficient	AR(1) dist	t	Number o Obs per F(2,178) Prob > F P> t	f groups group: mi av ma [95% c	n = g = x = = :onf.	10 19 19.0 19 129.49 0.0000 interval]
YE (within) r Group variabl s-squared: Within Between Overall corr(u_i, Xb) invest	egression with e: company = 0.5927 = 0.7989 = 0.7904 = -0.0454	n AR(1) dist		Number o Obs per F(2,178) Prob > F	f groups group: mi av ma	n = g = ix = = conf.	10 19 19.0 19 129.49 0.0000
YE (within) r Froup variabl S-squared: Within Between Overall corr(u_i, Xb) invest mvalue	egression with e: company = 0.5927 = 0.7989 = 0.7904 = -0.0454 Coefficient .0949999	AR(1) dist Std. err. .0091377	t 10.40	Number o Obs per F(2,178) Prob > F P> t  0.000	f groups group: mi av ma [95% c .07696	n = g = ix = = conf.	10 19 19.0 19 129.49 0.0000 interval] .113032
YE (within) r Froup variables B-squared: Within Between Overall corr(u_i, Xb) invest mvest mvalue kstock	egression with e: company = 0.5927 = 0.7989 = 0.7904 = -0.0454 Coefficient .0949999 .350161	AR(1) dist Std. err. .0091377 .0293747	t 10.40 11.92	Number o Obs per F(2,178) Prob > F P> t  0.000 0.000	f groups group: mi av ma [95% c .07696 .29215	n = g = ix = = conf.	10 19 19.0 19 129.49 0.0000 interval] .113032 .4081286
YE (within) r Froup variables B-squared: Within Between Overall corr(u_i, Xb) invest mvest mvalue kstock	egression with e: company = 0.5927 = 0.7989 = 0.7904 = -0.0454 Coefficient .0949999 .350161	AR(1) dist Std. err. .0091377 .0293747	t 10.40 11.92	Number o Obs per F(2,178) Prob > F P> t  0.000 0.000	f groups group: mi av ma [95% c .07696 .29215	n = g = ix = = conf.	10 19 19.0 19 129.49 0.0000 interval] .113032 .4081286
YE (within) r Froup variable -squared: Within Between Overall corr(u_i, Xb) invest mvalue kstock _cons	egression with e: company = 0.5927 = 0.7989 = 0.7904 = -0.0454 Coefficient .0949999 .350161 -63.22022	AR(1) dist Std. err. .0091377 .0293747	t 10.40 11.92	Number o Obs per F(2,178) Prob > F P> t  0.000 0.000	f groups group: mi av ma [95% c .07696 .29215	n = g = ix = = conf.	10 19 19.0 19 129.49 0.0000 interval] .113032 .4081286
YE (within) r Group variabl squared: Within Between Overall corr(u_i, Xb) invest mvalue kstock _cons rho_ar	<pre>egression with e: company = 0.5927 = 0.7989 = 0.7904 = -0.0454 Coefficient</pre>	AR(1) dist Std. err. .0091377 .0293747	t 10.40 11.92	Number o Obs per F(2,178) Prob > F P> t  0.000 0.000	f groups group: mi av ma [95% c .07696 .29215	n = g = ix = = conf.	10 19 19.0 19 129.49 0.0000 interval] .113032 .4081286

F test that all  $u_i=0$ : F(9,178) = 11.53

Prob > F = 0.0000

4

In all the examples thus far, we have assumed that  $\epsilon_{it}$  is first-order autoregressive. Testing the hypothesis of  $\rho = 0$  in a first-order autoregressive process produces test statistics with extremely complicated distributions. Bhargava, Franzini, and Narendranathan (1982) extended the Durbin–Watson statistic to the case of balanced, equally spaced panel datasets. Baltagi and Wu (1999) modify their statistic to account for unbalanced panels with unequally spaced data. In the same article, Baltagi and Wu (1999) derive the locally best invariant test statistic of  $\rho = 0$ . Both these test statistics have extremely complicated distributions, although Bhargava, Franzini, and Narendranathan (1982) did publish some critical values in their article. Specifying the 1bi option to xtregar causes Stata to calculate and report the modified Bhargava et al. Durbin–Watson and the Baltagi–Wu LBI.

### Example 3: Testing for autocorrelation

In this example, we calculate the modified Bhargava et al. Durbin–Watson statistic and the Baltagi– Wu LBI. We exclude periods 9 and 10 from the sample, thereby reproducing the results of Baltagi and Wu (1999, 822). *p*-values are not reported for either statistic. Although Bhargava, Franzini, and Narendranathan (1982) published critical values for their statistic, no tables are currently available for the Baltagi–Wu (LBI). Baltagi and Wu (1999) did derive a normalized version of their statistic, but this statistic cannot be computed for datasets of moderate size.

. xtregar inve	est mvalue kst	ock if year	!=1943 &	year !=1	944, fe lbi	
FE (within) re	egression with	AR(1) distu	irbances	Number o	f obs =	170
Group variable	e: company			Number o	f groups =	10
R-squared:				Obs per g	group:	
Within =	= 0.5907				min =	17
Between =	= 0.7938				avg =	17.0
Overall =	= 0.7879				max =	17
				F(2,158)	=	114.00
corr(u_i, Xb)	= -0.0339			Prob > F		0.0000
invest	Coefficient	Std. err.	t	P> t	[95% conf.	interval]
mvalue	.0922066	.0090362	10.20	0.000	.0743593	.1100539
kstock	.3509339	.0320278	10.96	0.000	.287676	.4141919
_cons	-61.69045	6.192364	-9.96	0.000	-73.92094	-49.45996
rho_ar	.67483913					
sigma_u	94.568243					
sigma_e	42.600124					
rho_fov	.83130847	(fraction o	of varian	ce because	e of u_i)	
						E = 0.0000

F test that all u\_i=0: F(9,158) = 10.66 Modified Bhargava et al. Durbin-Watson = .70578896 Baltagi-Wu LBI = 1.0218978 Prob > F = 0.0000

4

### The random-effects model

In the random-effects model, the  $\nu_i$  are assumed to be realizations of an i.i.d. process with mean 0 and variance  $\sigma_{\nu}^2$ . Furthermore, the  $\nu_i$  are assumed to be independent of both the  $\epsilon_{it}$  and the covariates  $\mathbf{x}_{it}$ . The latter of these assumptions can be strong, but inference is not conditional on the particular realizations of the  $\nu_i$  in the sample. See Mundlak (1978) for a discussion of this point.

### Example 4: Random-effects model

By specifying the re option, we obtain the Baltagi–Wu GLS estimator of the random-effects model. This estimator can accommodate unbalanced panels and unequally spaced data. We run this model on the Grunfeld dataset:

. xtregar inve	est mvalue kst	ock if year	!=1943 &	x year !=1	1944, re lbi	
RE GLS regress		) disturban	ces	Number o		180
Group variable	e: company			Number o	of groups =	10
R-squared:				Obs per	group:	
Within =	= 0.7718				min =	18
Between =	= 0.8036				avg =	18.0
Overall =	= 0.7956				max =	18
				Wald chi	i2(3) =	335.41
corr(u_i, Xb)	= 0 (assumed)			Prob > d		0.0000
	-					
invest	Coefficient	Std. err.	Z	P> z	[95% conf.	interval]
mvalue	.0948541	.0085443	11.10	0.000	.0781075	.1116007
kstock	. 322599	.0271626	11.88	0.000	.2693613	.3758368
_cons	-44.82233	27.24889	-1.64	0.100	-98.22918	8.584515
rho_ar	.67483913	(estimated	autocorr	elation o	coefficient)	
sigma_u	74.332091					
sigma_e	43.199999					
rho_fov	.74751539	(fraction	of variar	ice due to	o u_i)	
theta	.65649837					

Modified Bhargava et al. Durbin-Watson = .70578896 Baltagi-Wu LBI = 1.0218978

The modified Bhargava et al. Durbin–Watson and the Baltagi–Wu LBI are the same as those reported for the fixed-effects model because the formulas for these statistics do not depend on fitting the fixed-effects model or the random-effects model.

## Stored results

Scalars

xtregar, re stores the following in e():

bealarb	
e(N)	number of observations
e(N_g)	number of groups
e(df_m)	model degrees of freedom
e(g_min)	smallest group size
e(g_avg)	average group size
e(g_max)	largest group size
e(d1)	Bhargava et al. Durbin-Watson
e(LBI)	Baltagi-Wu LBI statistic
e(N_LBI)	number of obs used in e(LBI)
e(Tcon)	<b>1</b> if $T$ is constant
e(sigma_u)	panel-level standard deviation
e(sigma_e)	standard deviation of $\eta_{it}$
e(r2_w)	$R^2$ for within model
e(r2_o)	$R^2$ for overall model
e(r2_b)	$R^2$ for between model
e(chi2)	$\chi^2$
e(rho_ar)	autocorrelation coefficient
e(rho_fov)	$u_i$ fraction of variance
e(thta_min)	minimum $\theta$
e(thta_5)	$\theta$ , 5th percentile
e(thta_50)	$\theta$ , 50th percentile
e(thta_95)	$\theta$ , 95th percentile
e(thta_max)	maximum $\theta$
e(Tbar)	harmonic mean of group sizes
e(rank)	rank of e(V)
Macros	
e(cmd)	
e(cmd) e(cmdline)	xtregar command as typed
e(depvar)	name of dependent variable
e(ivar)	variable denoting groups
e(tvar)	variable denoting time within groups
e(model)	re
e(rhotype)	method of estimating $\rho_{\rm ar}$
e(dw)	lbi, if lbi specified
e(chi2type)	Wald; type of model $\chi^2$ test
e(properties)	b V
e(predict)	program used to implement predict
e(marginsok)	predictions allowed by margins
e(marginsnotok)	predictions disallowed by margins
e(asbalanced)	factor variables fvset as asbalanced
e(asobserved)	factor variables fvset as asobserved
Matrices	
e(b)	coefficient vector
e(V)	VCE for random-effects model
Functions	
e(sample)	marks estimation sample
c (pambre)	marks commanon sample

In addition to the above, the following is stored in r():

Matrices

r(table)

matrix containing the coefficients with their standard errors, test statistics, *p*-values, and confidence intervals

Note that results stored in r() are updated when the command is replayed and will be replaced when any r-class command is run after the estimation command.

xtregar, fe stores the following in e():

Scalars	
e(N)	number of observations
e(N_g)	number of groups
e(df_m)	model degrees of freedom
e(mss)	model sum of squares
e(rss)	residual sum of squares
e(g_min)	smallest group size
e(g_avg)	average group size
e(g_max)	largest group size
e(d1)	Bhargava et al. Durbin-Watson
e(LBI)	Baltagi-Wu LBI statistic
e(N_LBI)	number of obs used in e(LBI)
e(Tcon)	1 if T is constant
e(corr)	$\operatorname{corr}(u_i, Xb)$
e(sigma_u)	panel-level standard deviation
e(sigma_e)	standard deviation of $\epsilon_{it}$
e(r2_a)	adjusted $R^2$
e(r2_w)	$R^2$ for within model
e(r2_o)	$R^2$ for overall model
e(r2_b)	$R^2$ for between model
e(11)	log likelihood
e(11_0)	log likelihood, constant-only model
e(rho_ar)	autocorrelation coefficient
e(rho_fov)	$u_i$ fraction of variance
e(F)	F statistic
e(F_f)	F for $u_i=0$
e(df_r)	residual degrees of freedom
e(df_a)	degrees of freedom for absorbed effect
e(df_b)	numerator degrees of freedom for F statistic
e(rmse)	root mean squared error
e(Tbar)	harmonic mean of group sizes
e(rank)	rank of e(V)
Macros	
e(cmd)	xtregar
e(cmdline)	command as typed
e(depvar)	name of dependent variable
e(ivar)	variable denoting groups
e(tvar)	variable denoting time within groups
e(wtype)	weight type
e(wexp)	weight expression
e(model)	fe
e(rhotype)	method of estimating $\rho_{\rm ar}$
e(dw)	lbi, if lbi specified
e(properties)	b V
e(predict)	program used to implement predict
e(marginsok)	predictions allowed by margins
e(marginsnotok)	predictions disallowed by margins
e(asbalanced)	factor variables fyset as asbalanced
e(asobserved)	factor variables fyset as asobserved
Matrices e(b)	coefficient vector
e(D) e(V)	variance–covariance matrix of the estimators
	variance-covariance matrix of the estimators
Functions	
e(sample)	marks estimation sample

In addition to the above, the following is stored in r():

Matrices r(table)

matrix containing the coefficients with their standard errors, test statistics, *p*-values, and confidence intervals

Note that results stored in r() are updated when the command is replayed and will be replaced when any r-class command is run after the estimation command.

## Methods and formulas

Consider a linear panel-data model described by (1) and (2). The data can be unbalanced and unequally spaced. Specifically, the dataset contains observations on individual i at times  $t_{ij}$  for  $j = 1, \ldots, n_i$ .

Methods and formulas are presented under the following headings:

Estimating  $\rho$ Transforming the data to remove the AR(1) component The within estimator of the fixed-effects model The Baltagi–Wu GLS estimator The test statistics

### Estimating $\rho$

The estimate of  $\rho$  is always obtained after removing the group means. Let  $\tilde{y}_{it} = y_{it} - \bar{y}_i$ , let  $\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_{it} = \mathbf{x}_{it} - \bar{\mathbf{x}}_i$ , and let  $\tilde{\epsilon}_{it} = \epsilon_{it} - \bar{\epsilon}_i$ .

Then, except for the onestep method, all the estimates of  $\rho$  are obtained by running Stata's prais on

$$\widetilde{y}_{it} = \widetilde{x}_{it}\boldsymbol{\beta} + \widetilde{\epsilon}_{it}$$

See [TS] prais for the formulas for each of the methods.

When onestep is specified, a regression is run on the above equation, and the residuals are obtained. Let  $e_{it_{ij}}$  be the residual used to estimate the error  $\tilde{\epsilon}_{it_{ij}}$ . If  $t_{ij} - t_{i,j-1} > 1$ ,  $e_{it_{ij}}$  is set to zero. Given this series of residuals

$$\hat{\rho}_{\text{onestep}} = \frac{n}{m_c} \frac{\sum_{i=1}^{N} \sum_{t=2}^{T} e_{it} e_{i,t-1}}{\sum_{i=1}^{N} \sum_{t=1}^{T} e_{it}^2}$$

where n is the number of nonzero elements in e and  $m_c$  is the number of consecutive pairs of nonzero  $e_{it}s$ .

### Transforming the data to remove the AR(1) component

After estimating  $\rho$ , Baltagi and Wu (1999) derive a transformation of the data that removes the AR(1) component. Their  $C_i(\rho)$  can be written as

$$\int (1 - \rho^2)^{1/2} y_{it_{ij}} \qquad \text{if } t_{ij} = 1$$

$$y_{it_{ij}}^* = \left\{ \left(1 - \rho^2\right)^{1/2} \left\{ y_{i,t_{ij}} \frac{1}{\left(1 - \rho^{2(t_{ij} - t_{i,j-1})}\right)^{1/2}} - y_{i,t_{i,j-1}} \frac{\rho^{(t_{ij} - t_{i,j-1})}}{\left(1 - \rho^{2(t_{i,j} - t_{i,j-1})}\right)^{1/2}} \right\} \quad \text{if } t_{ij} > 1$$

Using the analogous transform on the independent variables generates transformed data without the AR(1) component. Performing simple OLS on the transformed data leaves behind the residuals  $\mu^*$ .

### The within estimator of the fixed-effects model

To obtain the within estimator, we must transform the data that come from the AR(1) transform. For the within transform to remove the fixed effects, the first observation of each panel must be omitted. Specifically, let

$$\begin{split} \breve{y}_{it_{ij}} &= y^*_{it_{ij}} - \overline{y}^*_i + \overline{\overline{y}}^* \qquad \forall j > 1 \\ \breve{\mathbf{x}}_{it_{ij}} &= \mathbf{x}^*_{it_{ij}} - \overline{\mathbf{x}}^*_i + \overline{\overline{\mathbf{x}}}^* \qquad \forall j > 1 \\ \breve{\epsilon}_{it_{ij}} &= \epsilon^*_{it_{ij}} - \overline{\epsilon}^*_i + \overline{\overline{\epsilon}}^* \qquad \forall j > 1 \end{split}$$

where

$$\begin{split} \overline{y}_{i}^{*} &= \frac{\sum_{j=2}^{n_{i}-1} y_{it_{ij}}^{*}}{n_{i}-1} \\ \overline{\overline{y}}^{*} &= \frac{\sum_{i=1}^{N} \sum_{j=2}^{n_{i}-1} y_{it_{ij}}^{*}}{\sum_{i=1}^{N} n_{i}-1} \\ \overline{\mathbf{x}}_{i}^{*} &= \frac{\sum_{j=2}^{n_{i}-1} \mathbf{x}_{it_{ij}}^{*}}{n_{i}-1} \\ \overline{\overline{\mathbf{x}}}^{*} &= \frac{\sum_{i=1}^{N} \sum_{j=2}^{n_{i}-1} \mathbf{x}_{it_{ij}}^{*}}{\sum_{i=1}^{N} n_{i}-1} \\ \overline{\overline{\epsilon}}_{i}^{*} &= \frac{\sum_{j=2}^{n_{i}-1} \epsilon_{it_{ij}}^{*}}{n_{i}-1} \\ \overline{\overline{\epsilon}}_{i}^{*} &= \frac{\sum_{i=1}^{N} \sum_{j=2}^{n_{i}-1} \epsilon_{it_{ij}}^{*}}{\sum_{i=1}^{N} n_{i}-1} \end{split}$$

The within estimator of the fixed-effects model is then obtained by running OLS on

$$\breve{y}_{it_{ij}} = \alpha + \breve{\mathbf{x}}_{it_{ij}}\boldsymbol{\beta} + \breve{\epsilon}_{it_{ij}}$$

Reported as  $R^2$  within is the  $R^2$  from the above regression. Reported as  $R^2$  between is  $\left\{ \operatorname{corr}(\overline{\mathbf{x}}_i \widehat{\boldsymbol{\beta}}, \overline{y}_i) \right\}^2$ . Reported as  $R^2$  overall is  $\left\{ \operatorname{corr}(\mathbf{x}_{it} \widehat{\boldsymbol{\beta}}, y_{it}) \right\}^2$ .

### The Baltagi–Wu GLS estimator

The residuals  $\mu^*$  can be used to estimate the variance components. Translating the matrix formulas given in Baltagi and Wu (1999) into summations yields the following variance-components estimators:

$$\begin{split} \widehat{\sigma}_{\omega}^{2} &= \sum_{i=1}^{N} \frac{(\mu_{i}^{*'}g_{i})^{2}}{(g_{i}'g_{i})} \\ \widehat{\sigma}_{\epsilon}^{2} &= \frac{\left[\sum_{i=1}^{N} (\mu_{i}^{*'}\mu_{i}^{*}) - \sum_{i=1}^{N} \left\{\frac{(\mu_{i}^{*'}g_{i})^{2}}{(g_{i}'g_{i})}\right\}\right]}{\sum_{i=1}^{N} (n_{i} - 1)} \\ \widehat{\sigma}_{\mu}^{2} &= \frac{\left[\sum_{i=1}^{N} \left\{\frac{(\mu_{i}^{*'}g_{i})^{2}}{(g_{i}'g_{i})}\right\} - N\widehat{\sigma}_{\epsilon}^{2}\right]}{\sum_{i=1}^{N} (g_{i}'g_{i})} \end{split}$$

where

$$g_{i} = \left[1, \frac{\left\{1 - \rho^{(t_{i,2} - t_{i,1})}\right\}}{\left\{1 - \rho^{2(t_{i,2} - t_{i,1})}\right\}^{\frac{1}{2}}}, \dots, \frac{\left\{1 - \rho^{(t_{i,n_{i}} - t_{i,n_{i}-1})}\right\}}{\left\{1 - \rho^{2(t_{i,n_{i}} - t_{i,n_{i}-1})}\right\}^{\frac{1}{2}}}\right]'$$

and  $\mu_i^*$  is the  $n_i \times 1$  vector of residuals from  $\mu^*$  that correspond to person i. Then

$$\widehat{\theta}_i = 1 - \left(\frac{\widehat{\sigma}_{\mu}}{\widehat{\omega}_i}\right)$$

where

$$\widehat{\omega}_i^2 = g_i' g_i \widehat{\sigma}_\mu^2 + \widehat{\sigma}_\epsilon^2$$

With these estimates in hand, we can transform the data via

$$z_{it_{ij}}^{**} = z_{it_{ij}}^* - \hat{\theta}_i g_{ij} \frac{\sum_{s=1}^{n_i} g_{is} z_{it_{is}}^*}{\sum_{s=1}^{n_i} g_{is}^2}$$

for  $z \in \{y, \mathbf{x}\}$ .

Running OLS on the transformed data  $y^{**}, \mathbf{x}^{**}$  yields the feasible GLS estimator of  $\alpha$  and  $\beta$ . Reported as  $R^2$  between is  $\left\{ \operatorname{corr}(\overline{\mathbf{x}}_i \widehat{\boldsymbol{\beta}}, \overline{y}_i) \right\}^2$ . Reported as  $R^2$  within is  $\left\{ \operatorname{corr}\{(\mathbf{x}_{it} - \overline{\mathbf{x}}_i)\widehat{\boldsymbol{\beta}}, y_{it} - \overline{y}_i\} \right\}^2$ . Reported as  $R^2$  overall is  $\left\{ \operatorname{corr}(\mathbf{x}_{it} \widehat{\boldsymbol{\beta}}, y_{it}) \right\}^2$ .

#### The test statistics

The Baltagi-Wu LBI is the sum of terms

$$d_* = d_1 + d_2 + d_3 + d_4$$

where

$$d_{1} = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^{N} \sum_{j=1}^{n_{i}} \{\tilde{z}_{it_{ij}} - \tilde{z}_{it_{i,j-1}} I(t_{ij} - t_{i,j-1} = 1)\}^{2}}{\sum_{i=1}^{N} \sum_{j=1}^{n_{i}} \tilde{z}_{it_{ij}}^{2}}$$
$$d_{2} = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^{N} \sum_{j=1}^{n_{i}-1} \tilde{z}_{it_{ij}}^{2} \{1 - I(t_{i,j+1} - t_{ij} = 1)\}}{\sum_{i=1}^{N} \sum_{j=1}^{n_{i}} \tilde{z}_{it_{ij}}^{2}}$$
$$d_{3} = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^{N} \tilde{z}_{it_{i1}}^{2}}{\sum_{i=1}^{N} \sum_{j=1}^{n_{i}} \tilde{z}_{it_{ij}}^{2}}$$
$$d_{4} = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^{N} \tilde{z}_{it_{in}}^{2}}{\sum_{i=1}^{N} \sum_{j=1}^{n_{i}} \tilde{z}_{it_{ij}}^{2}}$$

I() is the indicator function that takes the value of 1 if the condition is true and 0 otherwise. The  $\tilde{z}_{it_{i,i-1}}$  are residuals from the within estimator.

Baltagi and Wu (1999) also show that  $d_1$  is the Bhargava et al. Durbin–Watson statistic modified to handle cases of unbalanced panels and unequally spaced data.

### Acknowledgment

We thank Badi Baltagi of the Department of Economics at Syracuse University for his helpful comments.

### References

- Baltagi, B. H. 2009. A Companion to Econometric Analysis of Panel Data. Chichester, UK: Wiley.
- -----. 2013. Econometric Analysis of Panel Data. 5th ed. Chichester, UK: Wiley.
- Baltagi, B. H., and Q. Li. 1991. A transformation that will circumvent the problem of autocorrelation in an error-component model. *Journal of Econometrics* 48: 385–393. https://doi.org/10.1016/0304-4076(91)90070-T.
- Baltagi, B. H., and P. X. Wu. 1999. Unequally spaced panel data regressions with AR(1) disturbances. Econometric Theory 15: 814–823. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0266466699156020.
- Bhargava, A., L. Franzini, and W. Narendranathan. 1982. Serial correlation and the fixed effects model. Review of Economic Studies 49: 533–549. https://doi.org/10.2307/2297285.
- Drukker, D. M. 2003. Testing for serial correlation in linear panel-data models. Stata Journal 3: 168–178.
- Hoechle, D. 2007. Robust standard errors for panel regressions with cross-sectional dependence. Stata Journal 7: 281–312.
- Mundlak, Y. 1978. On the pooling of time series and cross section data. Econometrica 46: 69–85. https://doi.org/10.2307/1913646.

#### 16 xtregar — Fixed- and random-effects linear models with an AR(1) disturbance

Sosa-Escudero, W., and A. K. Bera. 2008. Tests for unbalanced error-components models under local misspecification. *Stata Journal* 8: 68–78.

Wursten, J. 2018. Testing for serial correlation in fixed-effects panel models. Stata Journal 18: 76-100.

### Also see

- [XT] **xtregar postestimation** Postestimation tools for xtregar
- [XT] **xtgee** GEE population-averaged panel-data models
- [XT] xtgls GLS linear model with heteroskedastic and correlated errors
- [XT] **xtreg** Fixed-, between-, and random-effects and population-averaged linear models<sup>+</sup>
- [XT] **xtset** Declare data to be panel data
- [TS] newey Regression with Newey-West standard errors
- [TS] prais Prais-Winsten and Cochrane-Orcutt regression

#### [U] 20 Estimation and postestimation commands

Stata, Stata Press, and Mata are registered trademarks of StataCorp LLC. Stata and Stata Press are registered trademarks with the World Intellectual Property Organization of the United Nations. StataNow and NetCourseNow are trademarks of StataCorp LLC. Other brand and product names are registered trademarks or trademarks of their respective companies. Copyright  $\bigcirc$  1985–2023 StataCorp LLC, College Station, TX, USA. All rights reserved.



For suggested citations, see the FAQ on citing Stata documentation.